The evidence base on lifelong guidance

Tristram Hooley (Professor of Career Education, University of Derby) presentation to the National Guidance Forum (nfb) and the Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF), Berlin.
What are politicians interested in?

- Active ageing.
- Active labour markets.
- Addressing youth transitions and unemployment.
- Economic development.
- Effective skills utilisation.
- Efficient investment in education and training.
- Employee engagement.
- Labour market efficiency.
- Labour market flexibility/flexicurity.
- Lifelong learning.
- Participation in vocational and higher education.
- Reducing early school-leaving.
- Social equity.
- Social inclusion.
- Supporting and enabling European mobility for learning and work.
Can lifelong guidance deliver this?

What evidence exists?

What do practitioners need to know to deliver this?

What would evidence based practice look like?
About the project

• Production of a guide to the evidence base in lifelong guidance.

• Primary audience – European policy makers.

• Developed by the European Lifelong Guidance Policy Network (ELGPN).
Challenges

- Multi-disciplinary task (education, psychology, sociology, economics)
- Diverse literature (academic, policy focused, programme evaluations)
- Range of places of publication
- International
- Multi-language
- Multi-sectoral (schools, VET, HE, adult education, work, unemployment)
Overview

Does career guidance work?

What works best?

Where do we go from here?
Does it work?
Some key papers on the efficacy of career guidance

- Bimrose et al.’s (2008) five-year longitudinal tracking study of 50 career guidance clients found that one-to-one guidance interventions were regarded as useful by clients, and that guidance services can support adults to make successful transitions in a turbulent labour market.
- Vuori et al.’s (2012) paper used a randomised control trial to demonstrate the impact of a group intervention on career management skills.
- Carey & Dimmitt (2012) found that there was consistent evidence of a positive relationship between well-organised school counselling programmes and the educational outcomes of students.
- And lots more… see the reference list in the paper.
Levels of impact

- Investment
- Take-up
- Reaction
- Learning
- Behaviour
- Results
- Return on investment

Evidenced based policy

Academic/professional research base for the field

Practitioners as users and creators of evidence
Overview

Does career guidance work?

What works best?

Where do we go from here?
1) Lifelong guidance is most effective where it is genuinely lifelong and progressive.

2) Lifelong guidance is most effective where it connects meaningfully to the wider experience and lives of the individuals who participate in it.

3) Lifelong guidance is most effective where it recognises the diversity of individuals and relates services to individual needs.

4) Lifelong guidance is not one intervention, but many, and works most effectively when a range of interventions are combined.

5) A key aim of lifelong guidance programmes should be the acquisition of career management skills.

6) Lifelong guidance needs to be holistic and well-integrated into other support services.

7) Lifelong guidance should involve employers and working people, and provide active experiences of workplaces.

8) The skills, training and dispositions of the professionals who deliver lifelong guidance are critical to its success.

9) Lifelong guidance is dependent on access to good-quality career information.

10) Lifelong guidance should be quality-assured and evaluated to ensure its effectiveness and to support continuous improvement.

10 evidence-based principles for the design of lifelong guidance services
Summarising the evidence base: focus on the individual

1) Lifelong guidance should be lifelong and progressive.

2) Lifelong guidance should connect meaningfully to individual’s wider experience and lives.

3) Lifelong guidance needs to recognise the diversity of individuals.
Summarising the evidence base: support learning and progression

4) Lifelong guidance is not one intervention, but many which work when combined.

5) Lifelong guidance should support individuals to acquire career management skills.

6) Lifelong guidance needs to be holistic and well-integrated into other support.

7) Lifelong guidance should involve employers and working people, and provide active experiences of workplaces.

Support learning and progression
Summarising the evidence base: ensuring quality

8) The skills, training and dispositions of the professionals are critical.

9) You need good-quality career information for effective lifelong guidance.

10) Lifelong guidance should be quality-assured and evaluated.

Ensure quality
Overview

- Does career guidance work?
- What works best?
- Where do we go from here?
Lifelong guidance policy cycle

1. Understanding what is known
2. Developing new policies and services
3. Implementing new policies and services
4. Monitoring implementation and checking efficacy

These steps form a cycle, with each step leading back to the first.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Key strengths</th>
<th>Areas for development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Schools</td>
<td>Extensive range of studies</td>
<td>Quantitative impact studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Return on investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocational education</td>
<td>Emergent literature</td>
<td>Increase the range and extent of studies in this area.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher education</td>
<td>Extensive range of studies</td>
<td>Impact on student employment rates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult education</td>
<td>Emergent literature</td>
<td>Increase the range and extent of studies in this area.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment to work</td>
<td>Extensive range of studies</td>
<td>Disentangle the impact of guidance active labour market policies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Also need to explore returns to work following career breaks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth transitions to work</td>
<td>Growing range of studies.</td>
<td>Disentangle impacts of guidance from active labour market policies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Longitudinal work.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mobility</td>
<td>A select number of high-quality studies.</td>
<td>Increase the range of studies to explore the impacts of both home and host country guidance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Workplace</td>
<td>Growing range of studies.</td>
<td>Disentangle the impact of guidance from HRD.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Return-on-investment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Older workers</td>
<td>Emergent literature</td>
<td>Increase the range and extent of studies in this area.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
We need to broaden...

- Practitioner use of evidence
- Practitioner creation of evidence
- Sectorial focus
- Disciplinary base
- Methodologies used
- Engagement with policy
References and resources


Tristram Hooley

Professor of Career Education
International Centre for Guidance Studies
University of Derby

http://www.derby.ac.uk/icegs

T.hooley@derby.ac.uk

@pigironjoe

Blog at

http://adventuresincareerdevelopment.wordpress.com
In conclusion

- There is an extensive evidence-base that supports lifelong guidance.
- This evidence base is international, multi-disciplinary, multi-sectorial and includes the use of a range of different research methods and paradigms.
- It is possible to derive principles from the evidence-base which can support the development of effective policy in the area.
- The evidence-base in lifelong guidance is necessarily a work in progress. Both governments and researchers need to commit to its ongoing development.